



# Council Minutes

May 23<sup>rd</sup>, 2023

**ROLL CALL:** Mayor Craven called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m. with Council President Chambers, Councilor Hansen, Councilor Solberg, Councilor Humphreys, and Councilor Winklepleck present. Public Works Superintendent Karl Frink, Administrative Assistant Elizabeth Coleman, Administrative Assistant Jannea Deaver Administrative Assistant Tammi Morrow, and City Administrator Scott McDowell were also present.

**ABSENT:** Councilor LaCoste was excused.

**PUBLIC:** Barbara Andersen, Dan Murphy, Mike Rodia, Bill Sattler, Nan & Steve Van Sandt, Don Lyon, Anita Pilkenton, Johnny Claasen, Nicole Solberg, Paul & Rose Winther, Kathleen Swayze, Joni Nelson, Gary Shepherd, Chenoweth Robertson, Heidi Winklepleck, Connie Bull, Tricia Thompson, Lynlee Bischoff, Yolonda & Rick Tauzer, Pamela Wright, Adam Tull, David Heinz, Joshua & Tina Kittel, Amy Herd, Scott & Rita Gese, Jeana Graham, Tom Snetsinger & Christina Herrman, Pamel Solberg, Anne & Clive Clarke, Don Andrews, Betty & Michael Doren, Tia Parrish (*The Times*), Penny Rosenberg (*Democrat-Herald*) & guest, and Deputy Frambes (*LCISO*) were present.

The pledge of allegiance was recited.

**ADDITIONS AND DELETIONS:** McDowell reviewed Council handouts that included Resolution 2023.11, a ROI grant funding ledger sheet, and an invitation to the RAIN & REAL Showcase on June 8<sup>th</sup>, 2023.

**MINUTES:** *Councilor Humphreys made a motion to approve the April 25<sup>th</sup>, 2023 meeting minutes as corrected with the Hansen abstention on Ordinance 800. Councilor Winklepleck seconded the motion and it passed unanimously.*

*Councilor Hansen made a motion to approve the May 4<sup>th</sup>, 2023 Budget Committee meeting minutes as presented. Councilor Solberg seconded the motion and it passed unanimously.*

## **PUBLIC HEARING | PRESENTATIONS:**

**Note:** The minutes have been slightly modified to reflect the actual flow of the meeting.

- Citizen Comments.** Mayor Craven moved Citizen Comments to the front of the meeting due to the number of people wishing to speak. Council agreed by consensus. Mayor Craven asked McDowell to explain the framework for the newly passed ordinance prior to discussion. McDowell said the City understands the importance of bees and beekeeping. The prohibition was decided after consultation with the City Attorney. McDowell received three word of mouth complaints from citizens over the last three months. A former Councilor asked about the ordinance that was modified in 2018. Council had intended to review the ordinance to amend the administrative review on beekeeping, but McDowell had never went back to the ordinance. The issue is about neighbor interaction. Over the last seven or eight years, neighbor interactions have changed. Neighbors hardly talk out their issues on their own. The City becomes overly involved in trying to restore a measure of civility in these instances. McDowell shared a story regarding loud music. The City put the Brownsville Municipal Code on-line which often makes the situation worse because interpretations and arguments are made in favor of one side or the other without the context of precedence and how the City enforces rules. McDowell said the intent of the ordinance was to be parallel to the prohibition of alcohol in Pioneer Park. As long as people responsibly partake of alcohol for a number of occasions including weddings, anniversaries, and other events, then there isn't a problem. As soon as aby situation turns into a problem, the Sheriff's Office has the ability to handle the situation as needed.



## **Council Minutes**

Mayor Craven turned the floor over to Dr. Mike Rodia, a representative of the Oregon State Beekeepers Association (OSBA), to review beekeeping best practices. Rodia had provided City Council with a packet of information prior to the meeting. He explained that OSBA consisted of predominantly hobby beekeepers. Rodia said that many cities have adopted beekeeping rules. He shared many examples of how good beekeeping practices keep everyone safe, even those who are allergic. He explained that the Africanized bee stopped about San Francisco because that species of bee does not like the rain. Honey bees typically keep their distance from humans. Yellow jackets, hornets and wasps are the species that sting indiscriminately. Rodia explained bee swarms. OSBA has nine regional offices and those offices are ready to help with any issue involving bees. Rodia's comments are attached as a part of the official minutes for this meeting.

Don Lyon, President of the Calapooia Food Alliance (CFA), reviewed the importance of bees as pollinators for gardens and flowers. Lyon shared experts to seek out for more information including Dr. Mike Rodia and Richard Little of Sweet Home, Oregon. Lyon said that beekeeping in urban areas pose a very small threat to humans. We must encourage beekeeping. Lyon's full comments are attached as a part of the official minutes for this meeting.

Anita Pilkington said that her husband Scott used to grow sunflowers for the purpose of attracting birds and bees to pollinate other plants on the farm. Anita said that if people are allergic to bees, take the necessary precautions. Have epi-pens on the ready to manage the negative health impact. She suggested wearing red as it is a deterrent for bees. You have to learn to overcome to live in certain environments.

Kathleen Swayze asked to be or not to be beginning by reviewing the difference between the honey bee and other species such as yellow jackets, hornets, wasps, etc. The species that sting like people food and they can be aggressive. Kathleen asked how would you even do a bee ban? She stated that the odds of dying from a bee sting in the United States is 1 in 5,555,556. She suggested reviewing the ordinance from Hubbard, Oregon as a practical approach to beekeeping. Swayze's full comments are attached as a part of the official minutes for this meeting.

Joni Nelson spoke about the impact of bees on her property and on the town.

Nan Van Sandt said she would talk about God, Sex & Politics. She said fear is a powerful motivator and described what happened to her personally during the Pandemic. She said that dog bites and cats cause more harm than bees. Would Council consider banning dogs and cats? Bees travel up to three miles to pollinate. If beekeeping is done properly, keepers don't even get stung. Van Sandt has captured swarms from Joni Nelson's property and relocated bees to Jad Lemhouse's property. She said that God wants us take care of the least of things and that includes the bees.

Steve Van Sandt asked why Council would want to throw in with the lot of politicians in Salem. There is no clear and present danger with bees. Steve reviewed other things people are allergic to including peanut butter. Should we ban peanut butter sandwiches? It is important for there to be certain practices in an ordinance that should include fly away barriers and water for the bees being kept.

Yolonda Tauzer addressed a recent Facebook post made by Mayor Craven. Yolonda said that she sent an email to Council and Staff and received not one response back. The silence was deafening. Yolonda said spare me your piety about the Bible, the pilgrims and guns referenced in the prayer delivered prior to the meeting. Indigenous people did not even have religious freedom recognized until 1978. Tauzer's full comments are attached as a part of the official minutes for this meeting.

Jeana Graham shared a short video showing bee handler Iylah Molyneaux to demonstrate safety. Graham said she liked the stance Council took on Covid because they did not give into the pressure or fear.



## Council Minutes

Barbara Andersen addressed Mayor Craven's Facebook post. Andersen said she was upset by the tone of the post. Andersen said she was sorry Craven's truck was stolen. Claiming people who were Democrats were mentally unwell makes her feel threatened. She does not know how Craven expects to work with people who he feels this way about. Andersen asked for Mayor Craven to resign.

Gary Shepherd shared a terrible experience involving a bee sting a friend of his had. He said that this person went into anaphylactic shock and spent several days in the hospital. The situation was life threatening. Maybe someone should tell the farmers to not place the hives so close to the road.

Anne Clarke as the precinct leader for the Linn County Democratic Party. Anne said that Democrats are not a small outlier of constituents of Brownsville nor are they a pack of crazies. She shared some personal experiences with Staff and Council that had been very productive during her time in Brownsville. Clarke said she recently visited with Councilor Hansen about the Council's Code of Conduct. Clarke asked how the Council intended on handling these comments that were made. How does Council police your own members?

*Mayor Craven added Bill Sattler under Presentations and Public Hearings:*

**Bill Sattler** – Sattler shared with Council that he had been a part of the Planning Commission prior to becoming the City Planner. Sattler worked in code enforcement for ten years in the City. Sattler said that he is baffled by the lack of investigation on the entire situation involved the bees and this ordinance. People could be fined up to \$500 per day based on the way the ordinance is written as an offense. The City is not allowed to "grandfather" any property in because that is a zoning related practice. Writing an ordinance that allows the City to pick and choose who they enforce against is appalling and shows a lack of understanding about law in general. Sattler continued that the way the ordinance was adopted may pose a violation of Oregon's Public Meetings Law. Sattler went back to see the several ordinances have been passed by emergency, however, the City Charter requires an emergency ordinance to have a unanimous vote to pass. Based, on what Sattler could see from the website the Beekeeping Ordinance and the HB3115 Ordinance failed due to not meeting the requirement of the Charter. Sattler said that if Council passes an ordinance, the City is sued on the validity of that ordinance, they could lose in court. This creates a significant liability for the City of Brownsville. Sattler put in a Public Records request and received a link to the Council meeting and information from Dr. Mike Rodia. Sattler explained the process of taking a complaint and how that process would lead to the development of an ordinance. He finds it hard to believe that no documentation was produced. Sattler suggested Council review all ordinance passed by emergency since McDowell started as City Administrator to determine if this was missed on any other law passed by the City.

**Proposed Use of State Revenue Sharing** – Mayor Craven opened the floor to discussion on the City's proposed use of State Revenue Sharing. No members of the public commented on the proposed use of State Revenue Sharing.

**Budget Public Hearing | FY 2023-2024** – Mayor Craven opened the floor to discussion on the City's proposed budget and to discuss State Revenue Sharing. No members of the public commented on the proposed budget.

### **DEPARTMENT REPORTS:**

1. **Linn County Sheriff's Office (LCSO) Report.** Sergeant Frambes reviewed the stats for April. Frambes reported that Mayor Craven's rig was stolen along with several other issues involving traffic out of town that have taken a lot of time. Councilor Humphreys appreciated the way the LCSO handles traffic stops. Councilor Winklepleck touched on the ride along program and Councilor Hansen mentioned the Citizen's Academy program.
2. **Public Works.** Public Works Superintendent Karl Frink reported progress on several projects including preparations being made for the Rec Center Renovation project, switching the water



## Council Minutes

treatment plant over to the infiltration gallery, turning on the pumps for the Mill Race, catching up on mowing, preparing the cemetery for Memorial Day and training the new Park Caretakers.

3. **Administration.** Administrator Scott McDowell discussed details and logistics for the Rec Center Renovation project. The project is slated to begin on June 5<sup>th</sup>, 2023 with a projected completion date of September 30<sup>th</sup>, 2023. The Rural Economic Alliance (REAL) is rolling out their five-year strategic plan. McDowell was recently invited to Halsey to review the details. Disaster Preparedness efforts are stalling a bit due to budgetary constraints of the entities involved with this effort. McDowell said the group is moving forward with the development of an intergovernmental agreement and the development of standard operating procedures for setting up an Emergency Operations Center. Tammi Morrow reviewed continuing efforts of the Emergency Preparedness Committee highlighting some upcoming events for the group to spread the word about preparedness. Morrow also encouraged everyone to check out the resources on the [www.clcepc.org](http://www.clcepc.org) website.
4. **Planning.** No comments.
5. **Library.** No comments.
6. **Office.** No comments.
7. **Court.** No comments.
8. **Council Comments.** No comments.
9. **Citizen Comments.** Conducted earlier in the meeting. See above.

### **LEGISLATIVE:**

1. **Resolution 2023.10: Election to Receive State Revenue Sharing** – *Councilor Hansen made a motion to approve the annually required resolution as presented. Councilor Winklepleck seconded the motion and it passed unanimously.*
2. **Resolution 2023.11: Government Capital Loan Terms** – McDowell reviewed the terms of the loan that included a fifteen (15) year term. The City can pay off the loan without penalty after 8 years. Interest is 5.049% with an annual payment just under \$58,000. *Councilor Solberg made a motion to approve the resolution outlining the gap financing needed for the Rec Center Renovation project as presented. Councilor Hansen seconded the motion and it passed unanimously.*
3. **Ordinance 801: Memorials (First Reading)** – Council gave this ordinance as recommended by the Parks & Open Space Advisory Board a first reading. McDowell shared that the Board wanted to streamline the way memorials would be placed in Pioneer Park. Council will consider passage at the next Council meeting. *Councilor Hansen moved to read the ordinance by title only. Councilor Winklepleck seconded. The motion carried.* Mayor Craven read the ordinance title.
4. **Proclamation: National Military Appreciation Month** – Mayor Craven recognized May & June as National Military Appreciation Month.

### **ACTION ITEMS:**

1. **Legislative Advocacy & Policy Committee (LAPC) Recommendations** – Council discussed the recommendations from the Legislative Advocacy & Policy Committee (LAPC) regarding how the City would create position papers on issues impacting City services and operations. The recommendations also included suggestions for Council agenda and the City's use of social media



## Council Minutes

to name a few. Council agreed by consensus that the items in the report are prudent and sent the items that need to be developed back to the Committee for more work. Councilor Hansen said that it took a few meetings to come to the recommendations as presented this evening as issues are complex and determining the proper way to analyze the data will be challenging.

*Councilor Chambers made a motion to accept all recommendations from the LAPC and to recommend Staff work on the necessary policies with a subcommittee of Councilors. Councilor Solberg seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.*

2. **Park Avenue Closure Request | Dawnita Nealon & Dayna Hansen** – Councilor Solberg made a motion to authorize the closure of Park Avenue for a Chamber of Commerce event to be held on September 23<sup>rd</sup>, 2023 provided the organizers meet all necessary requirements. Councilor Winklepleck seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.
3. **GR12 Waterline | Authorize Necessary Signatures** – Councilor Chambers made a motion to authorize Mayor Craven and Administrator McDowell to execute all necessary documents for the pending GR12 Waterline project. Councilor Hansen seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

### **DISCUSSION ITEMS:**

1. **Park Caretakers.** Council & Staff are happy to welcome and announce Walter & Marta Lynch as Park Caretakers.
2. **ROI Grant Disbursements | Inception-to-Date** – McDowell provided an updated report on monies received from the State and the expenditures associated with this project supporting the Rural Economic Alliance (REAL) and the Regional Accelerator Incubator Network (RAIN).
3. **April Financials.** No comments.

### **CITIZEN QUESTIONS & COMMENTS.**

Lynlee Bischoff stated her willingness to cover graffiti at the Park if the paint is provided.

Yolonda Tauzer said she is not always here to criticize. Council does good things and volunteers time to the community. Tauzer expressed concern about a recent article written by Penny Rosenberg in the *Albany Democrat-Herald* about Councilor Chambers' position on women's sports made during Women's History month. Yolonda felt that women could have been celebrated instead of mentioning the transgender issue. She also felt that Mayor Craven gave his opinion about Veronica's Christie's death at a previous meeting that may or may not have been accurate. Yolonda would like to see the City do more for Women's History Month. Tauzer asked Councilor Winklepleck to clarify his reasons for asking Librarian Sherri Lemhouse about how books are selected in the Library. Tauzer is concerned about books being banned from libraries.

### **COUNCIL COMMENTS.**

Councilor Chambers felt she was misquoted by the *Albany Democrat-Herald* article. She stated further that she was simply pointing out articles that were in the USA Today and other national media sources showing what the Biden administration decided to focus on during Women's History Month.



## Council Minutes

Councilor Solberg asked Council to revisit the beekeeping ordinance. Solberg is in agreement with comments made by the community this evening. Councilor Humphreys wanted to adopt rules that were in-line with the City of Hubbard that have requirements that provide guidance for owners and Staff.

McDowell suggested that Councilor Solberg could work on the beekeeping ordinance and bring something back to Council at a future meeting. *Councilor Solberg made a motion to suspend Ordinance 800. Councilor Humphreys seconded, and the motion passed unanimously.*

Councilor Winklepleck said that he really appreciated the way the community interacted with Council this evening. Council is trying to do our best for the community. He wanted to clarify that his wife is not allergic to bees as he heard throughout the month. Winklepleck also addressed the question posed by Tauzer regarding the library. He said he feels it is important to have decent reading materials in our library for children.

**ADJOURNMENT:** Mayor Craven moved for adjournment. Council agreed by consensus, and the meeting adjourned at 9:40 p.m.

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to be "SM", written over a horizontal line.

City Administrator S. Scott McDowell

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to be "ADC", written over a horizontal line.

Mayor Adam Craven

**Statements Scan to SM from May 23<sup>rd</sup>, 2023 Council Meeting**

Statements are in order, but not everyone submitted their statements.

- Ralph Rodia
- Don Lyon
- Anita Pilkenton (no statement submitted)
- Kathleen Swayze
- Joni Nelson (no statement submitted)
- Nan Van Sandt (no statement submitted)
- Steve Van Sandt (no statement submitted)
- Yolanda Tauzer
- Jeana Graham
- Barbara Anderson
- Gary Shepherd (no statement submitted)
- Anne Clarke (no statement submitted)
- Vivienne Edwards (statement provide, but she was not at the meeting)
- Bill Sattler Diatribe

May23, 2023

Brownsville City Council  
253 Main Street  
P.O. Box 188  
Brownsville, OR 97327

Re: Ordinance No. 800 and Municipal Code 6.10.060, Bees and Beekeeping

The Oregon State Beekeepers Association (OSBA) appreciates this opportunity to present additional information, concerning the city's recent adoption of a ban on bees and beekeeping in Brownsville. We hope that you had time to review the previously provided information. The information was divided into three parts because:

1. We wanted you to know more about honeybees, beekeeping, and that honeybees pose little or no hazard, as compared to other concerns. A ban is not necessary, and
2. In 2015, Oregon passed legislation requiring cities and counties to review their rules in accordance with beekeeping "Best Practices" from Oregon State University (OSU), the Department of Agriculture (DOA) and beekeeping organizations, and
3. We wanted you to have examples of the rules, adopted by large and small Oregon cities and counties, that are based on the guidelines from OSU and those of the League of Oregon Cities. None of these rules, that have been adopted, since 2018 include bans.

Also consider:

I am 83 years old and that I have been a beekeeper for over 25 years and that I have never been stung by a honeybee, unless I have hurt a honeybee or taken a hive (their home) apart. And this is true for most beekeepers. I keep about 300,000 honeybees. I don't like being stung any less than anyone else; it hurts. Honeybees do not sting beekeepers or anyone else, unless they are threatened. Also my wife, children and grandchildren and friends have not been stung, even though my hives are in my backyard, near my deck and the family and others are frequently near them. Honeybees do not select to sting someone, simply because that person is allergic.

A ban on honeybees will not prevent a sting from a Bumble Bee, a yellow jacket or other insect. Many of those who are allergic to honeybee stings are also allergic to stings from other "bees". The venom from other "bees" can contain similar allergens. And, a sting from a yellow jacket is much more likely and hurt more than a sting from a honeybee. Yellow jackets and hornets are the aggressive insects that invade your picnic and outdoor activities, as they seek food or liquid.

The small City of Hubbard, north of Woodburn, considered a ban on honeybees, in part, because the mayor's nephew is highly allergic to stings. The young nephew did not want to, nor could he be relied upon to carry an Epi-Pen. At the same time, the city also



mistakenly considered Oregon's honeybees to be "related" to the notorious Africanized honeybees bees, that have invaded the USA southern states, and which have never been, and which are unlikely to ever be in Oregon. After a review of the information, concerning honeybees and beekeeping and with input from Hubbard citizens, the city, instead adopted rules based on the 2015 Oregon law and the OSU "Best Practices" guidelines. A copy of Hubbard's beekeeping rules are in the packet of information previously provided to the Council.

Honeybees will swarm as part of the hive seeks a new home. Swarms may land in a tree, in a chimney, in a wall or the soffit of a house. Although swarms are not a threat to people or pets, many are afraid of them. A swarm could come from feral hives in the city or from hives used to pollinate the meadowfoam not far from downtown. Local beekeepers will gladly remove swarms. That is better than trying to kill the much needed pollinators or to await a beekeeper from outside the city to collect the swarm.

Typically, governing agencies do not prevent their citizens from having an interest or hobby, unless it is threat to the community. A ban denies every Brownsville citizen the right to the hobby of residential beekeeping and to collect and use honey, beeswax, pollen and other products of the hive. A ban also reduces the number of pollinators that are needed by backyard gardeners to pollinate their fruit trees and vegetables. I know this to be true, as the yields of fruit and vegetables from my garden, more than doubled after I became a beekeeper. A city might instead, consider a ban on peanuts and their products as many more people are allergic to peanuts than to bee stings. Since honeybees and beekeeping, are for most people, of little concern, a ban is not appropriate to apply to everyone in the city.

The 2015 law was adopted because legislators from rural and urban settings recognized the plight of Oregon's pollinators and that existing residential beekeeping codes varied from non-existent, to in some cases bans, and did little to help support pollinators for backyard gardens and to help replace the loss of feral colonies with their own genetics, that once were plentiful throughout Oregon. It was expected that by providing the "Best Practices" there would be less confusion and conflict over how or if residential beekeeping needed rules and if so what should they be. So far, the many rules, that have been adopted throughout the state, and that allow for residential beekeeping, have not added any complaints or problems about residential beekeeping. Those who are allergic to stings have learned how to address their concerns; just as those sensitive to peanut allergens have.

Ralph (Mike) Rodia, PhD, Residential Beekeeping Liaison  
Oregon State Beekeepers Association (OSBA)  
4194-12<sup>th</sup> St, Cut-Off S.E.  
Salem, Oregon 97302  
503-364-3275 rrodia@msn.com

May 22, 2023

Council President Lynda Chambers  
255 Main Street  
P.O. Box 188  
Brownsville, OR 97327

Re: Ordinance No.800 and Municipal Code 6.10.060 (Farm Animals) and Bees

The Oregon State Beekeepers Association (OSBA) appreciates the opportunity to present this information. We represent commercial and residential **honeybee** keepers throughout the state, and have an interest in actions and regulations that may affect beekeepers whether they are hobbyists, small scale or commercial operators. The OSBA has been involved in a number of instances where well-meaning governmental agencies while serving their residents, have or sought to adopt rules/codes that place undue restrictions on **residential** beekeeping. Our intent is to provide expertise and assistance to these agencies as they address the **keeping of honeybees** in the urban environment. To this end we have attached informational materials divided into three categories:

1. General information: Honeybees and Beekeeping; the Honeybee Sting vs Other Hazards; Expert testimony at the McMinnville code hearing (2008) and the article What happens if Bees Go Extinct?, and

2. Rules and Codes: Why Have Residential Beekeeping Rules?; Legislative Resolution 9 (2015); Oregon House Bill 2653 (2015) and Oregon Revised Statutes 602.045 and 602.090 (2015); the League of Oregon Cities Model Beekeeping Ordinance (2018); and the Oregon State Extension booklet EM 9186 “Best-Practice Guidelines” for Residential Beekeeping (2018), and

3. Examples of Residential Honeybee and Beekeeping Codes/Rules: Including those for Hubbard (2021), Ashland (2021), Springfield (2020), Bend, Gresham (2015), Salem (2019), Marion County (2019), Eugene (2021), and Ohio (2019).

We strongly encourage you to review this information, as you consider our request and those of others to change Municipal Code 6.10.060 to allow **residential** honeybees and honeybee beekeeping in Brownsville.

As we understand it, the recent code adoption included, in part, a ban on bees and beekeeping in response to a resident’s concern, that due to an allergy, a “bee” sting could be life threatening. We understand the concern. The OSBA has member beekeepers who were once highly allergic (potential death) to stings. After being desensitized these beekeepers, now have little or no reaction to honeybee stings. Your concerned resident might consider this option. In any case, honeybees have no interest in stinging humans unless they are interfered with. Moreover, honeybees cannot select someone who is allergic to sting over someone else. Honeybees die in the process of stinging and will

sting only those who are threat to them. Africanized bees (which have never been in Oregon) are the exception.

As Oregon became more urban, codes/rules were adopted to ban or limit “farm animals” within city limits. Although, strictly speaking residential honeybees are not farm animals, many of those earlier adoptions, also covered all honeybee keeping, since commercial beekeeping was not wanted in urban areas. Today, nearly all of those earlier codes/rules have been updated and they now allow residential (but not commercial) beekeeping. The lone exception is Brownsville’s recently adopted code. We know of no other Oregon city that has an outright ban for residential beekeeping.

Since 2018, other Oregon cities and counties have responded to the intent and requirements of House Bill 2653 (2015) and Oregon Revised Statutes (ORS) 602.045 and 602.090 (2015), by adopting or revising their residential beekeeping rules. This is in accordance with the ORS law, along with recommendations from the League of Oregon Cities and Oregon State University, that allow for residential beekeeping; under certain conditions; but continue to prohibit commercial beekeeping within urban areas. We would like Brownsville to consider the basis for and intent of other cities as they regulate bees and honeybee keeping, that best serve the interests and needs of their citizens.

For clarification since “bees” are not defined in the code, Brownsville has also outlawed other pollinators including Mason Bees (non-aggressive, cannot sting and great pollinators which supplement honeybees); Bumble Bees; fly bees and many other bees, which would also include yellow jackets and wasps, that many lay persons also consider to be “bees”. How that ban would be enforced is questionable as those insects reside in, fly about and through Brownsville, independent of any beekeeper.

When chickens, rabbits, miniature horses and pigs, Mason Bees, honeybees and other animals are kept in urban areas they are not considered to be “farm animals” but “pets” and should and cannot be subject to the same rules that would pertain to their use as farm animals. For clarification Brownsville Municipal Code should be revised to read “**Commercial** bees and **commercial** beekeeping are not permitted in city limits.”

We again thank you for the opportunity to express our concerns,

Ralph (Mike) Rodia, PhD, Residential Beekeeping Liaison  
Oregon State Beekeepers Association (OSBA)  
4194-12<sup>th</sup> St. Cut-Off S.E.  
Salem, OR 97302  
503-364-3275 rrodia@msn.com

cc: Harry Vanderpool, Past President; OSBA  
Joe Maresh, President OSBA  
Everett Kaser, Linn Benton Beekeepers Association  
Rosanna Mattingly, OSBA Newsletter Editor

### **Bees and Beekeeping--statement by Donald Lyon, 352 Kirk AV, BV**

I am speaking as President of the Calapooia Food Alliance, the local non-profit organization that operates the Community Garden and the Thursday Market and is dedicated to encouraging, promoting and educating our community about the benefits of healthy, local and sustainable food production and consumption. I am also speaking as a Master Gardener with 10 years experience in encouraging others to follow safe sustainable practices in gardening. Thus I am very concerned about any ordinance that restricts beekeeping.

I believe the Council passed the Beekeeping Ordinance in a hasty manner without considering the impact of the ban. I am respectfully requesting the Council to revisit this Ordinance and either remove it or modify it to allow beekeeping within City Limits with certain restrictions. I offer two resources that are willing to advise on the creation of a beekeeping ordinance that protects everyone's interests.

The first is Mike Rodia, lead author of the OSU Extension publication "Best-Practice Guidelines for Residential Beekeeping" (2018). That booklet describes the many ways that beekeepers can raise bees in urban environments with very little danger to anyone else. Mike advises the State Legislature on behalf of the Oregon State Beekeepers Association so he has the skills to write a practical ordinance for Brownsville.

The second resource is Richard Little of Sweet Home who operates the Mason Bee program for OSU Extension. He has devoted his life to understanding insects--the good ones, the bad ones and the in-between ones. Rich was a State Entomologist before his retirement. He is also willing to help City Council draft a practical ordinance that would allow beekeeping in the city without danger to others. Richard Little can be reached through the OSU Extension office. I'm including contacts details for Dr. Rodia and Richard Little in my copy for the Minutes.

Please let these two experts help you craft an ordinance that should satisfy 99% of the Brownsville population. In conclusion I'd like to say that every school child knows that bees are struggling to survive -- mites, habitat loss and pesticides are taking a terrible toll. Honeybees are essential to the pollination of over one-third of the foods we eat. I wish I had honey-beekeepers living next to me to pollinate my vegetables, my raspberries and fruit trees. Shouldn't we be encouraging beekeepers rather than banning them. Thank you.

(sweethomerich@comcast.net, rrodia@msn.com)

*Kathleen Swayze*

## **To Bee or Not to Bee, that is the question.**

If "not to bee" is the answer then let's review the consequences;

- 1) We should start with the definition of bee. Honey bees, Andony Melathopoulos, are pollinators. They are NOT yellow jackets, hornets, wasps, etc., though many people think they are and just call them bees. They are NOT. This group of insects are aggressive and like people food like pop, beer, hot dogs, meat, potato salad- They will be at your next BBQ. They are aggressive and they sting!  
Honey bees are pollinators, they like flowering fruits, vegetables, trees and flowers, not BBQ's.
- 2) Honey bees travel 2-3 miles even 5 miles from their hive or bee box to their flowers. There are hundreds of commercial bee boxes surrounding Brownsville that the farmers put out to pollinate their crops. They are there through the summer.
- 3) How are we going to identify these out of towners from our honey bees? Should we erect nets, post signs (small ones), or perhaps a wall? It could be more effective to ban flowers and fruit trees from our community so they wouldn't attract honey bees across our town border.
- 4) How will we be enforcing the bee ban? Very small bee jails or rehab centers, counseling? What about repeat offenders...community service?

Seriously, why not have reasonable regulation of honey bees and bee keepers? After all 33% of all our food is pollinated by honey bees and other pollinating bees. Mortality rates from stings in the US are 1 in 5,555,556. You have more of a chance of dying falling out of bed. Our pollinators are in sharp decline. We need to encourage education about and protection of them, our food supply depends on it.

I urge you to review the common sense regulations the city of Hubbard adopted on May 28, 2021. Hubbard is a small rural town of about 3,500 people. They adopted a simple 9 point regulation of residential bee keeping. It's working. Contact them.

It would be a sensible guide for Brownsville too. Honey bees are too vital to our global and local community to ban. Please let them bee.

Kathleen Swayze  
185 S. Main St, Brownsville

Hubbard, Oregon  
Population 3,440  
May 28, 2023

## GENERAL REGULATIONS

### Chapter 6.05.185

Honeybees may be kept in the city consistent with the following standards:

- (1) Honeybee colonies shall only be kept on a lot or parcel that has a single-family detached dwelling in which the beekeeper resides.
- (2) The number of colonies shall not exceed one on any lot with a minimum area of 5,000 square feet, up to two colonies on any lot with a minimum area of 7,000 square feet, and up to three colonies on any lot of 10,000 square feet or larger. The number of hives per lot may be increased by two during the current beekeeping season when those additional hives are formed by the making of splits of the collections of swarms. Every February the hives shall be reduced to the original requirement.
- (3) All portions of the hive/colony enclosures shall be located in side and/or rear yards.
- (4) A flyway barrier at least six feet in height consisting of a solid wall, solid fencing material, dense vegetation or combination thereof that is parallel to the property line and extends 10 feet beyond the colony in each direction, unless the adjoining property is undeveloped for a minimum of 25 feet past the property line.
- (5) Colonies shall be maintained in moveable-frame hives with adequate space and management techniques to prevent overcrowding.
- (6) Beekeeper shall maintain an adequate supply of water for colonies within 25 feet of each hive on the property where the honeybees are located.
- (7) Beekeeper will abide by any disease prevention directive issued by the State of Oregon Department of Agriculture.
- (8) Beekeeping appliances shall be kept in a clean condition at all times by taking such action as deemed necessary to prevent any condition which may be dangerous or detrimental to public health, the health of the colony or constitute a nuisance.
- (9) Bees kept on agricultural-use property that are properly registered with the State of Oregon are exempt from this code. (Ord. 346-2016 2)

The Hubbard Municipal Code is current through Ordinance 371-2021, passed March 9, 2021.

City Council Mtg.  
May 23, 2023

Regarding Mayor Craven's recent Facebook post. He knows how I feel, as do all members on this Council. My letter re Craven's post was published in The Times. I also sent an email to all the Council members, which is included in tonight's Council packet. I would have liked to have ~~received~~ <sup>received</sup> some feedback from Council members regarding my concerns, but their silence on this issue was deafening. Not a word, not a peep, not even a simple "Thank you for your concern." Nada! So, to me, that means 1. They have no opinion one way or another 2. They agree with Craven's statements or 3. They just don't give a damn.

I must admit some trepidation standing here tonight before a mayor who has made it known that he doesn't like people like me. I am mentally ill, morally bankrupt, and if those words hurt my feelings, I can go piss up a rope. Thank you, Mayor Craven, for those kind, thoughtful mature words. After making such statements, how can I believe that you can or ever will respect me or any issue / concern that I may bring before this Council.

Yolonda Tucker  
192 Kirk Ave.  
Brownsville, Or.

*Jeanne Graham*

Thankful for Free Speech

Appreciate Brownsville City Council standing up against the fear of COVID mandates that have now been dropped.

Saddens me how our little town has turned into a war zone with neighbors holding out fists of rage for each other rather than helping hands.

I believe we all can have a difference of opinion but treat each other with respect and gratitude.

I wonder why the council is now responding to the fear or pressure of those who are afraid of bee stings or finding a reason to sting their neighbor by using a precious resource we all need, the work of the honey bee.

Here is a clip from Wild Everlasting Farms. Lylah is 15 years old and keeps bees with her parents in Dorena, Oregon. Please watch how she can easily take out bees straight from the hive without fear or being stung.

Thank you



# Barbara Andersen

Adam, I am addressing you and I am sure you know why. I am a registered Democrat as are 20% of your constituents...based on your recent writings to you that means that I am either mentally unwell or morally bankrupt. Apparently I disgust you...and if hearing that should "hurt my feelers". I can go piss up a rope! I looked that up to be sure...It is synonymous with ~~Fuck~~ Off. I am very sorry your truck was stolen that would make anyone angry. Blaming it on all your constituents who are Democrats is conduct unbecoming your position in this town. You held yourself up as an adult, a person who could lead, and you promised to be mayor for all the citizens of Brownsville, what you have written on a public forum makes it clear that you can not, and have no intention of, doing that. Crime has not run rampant here and Brownsville is not a shit hole town. To end your diatribe with a call to action against all of the citizens who disagree with you is beyond the pale. I personally feel threatened by your Last line...We ride at dawn! That is a call to violence that has started some serious situations in this country. I don't know how I, or many other people in this town will be able to take you seriously as mayor and hold serious discussions with you knowing how you really feel about us. Many people have told me there is no point in addressing you, that you won't listen, but I am here tonight because silence implies consent, and I can not be silent in this matter. As you are no longer effective in your position having shown that you are unable to act with dignity and integrity as the mayor of all the citizens of Brownsville as you pledged, I am asking you to resign.

Thank you for the time.

The Mayor and City Council

Brownsville City Hall

Brownsville OR 97327

5/22/23

Mayor and City Council,

Ref: Bee ban in City of Brownsville.

I am unable to be present at the Council meeting on 5/23/23. However, I am deeply disturbed by a recent ban, as I understand it, which prevents bee keeping within the city limits. I would like to draw your attention to the following points.

1. We need pollinators. If the bees die, then we die.
2. The bees do not recognize the city boundaries.
3. The fields around Brownsville are filled with hives.
4. Many people cannot distinguish a bee from a wasp.

I am enclosing two packets of information; one on residential beekeeping which may be helpful to those who are unfamiliar with bees.

The second packet is a model bee keeping ordinance from the league of Oregon Cities which I think might be very helpful for Brownsville.

Sincerely,



Vivienne Edwards Berry,

928, Pine St, Brownsville OR 97327

\* Information provided by Vivienne Edwards Berry is identical to the information provided by Dr. Mike Rodia included herein -



## S. Scott McDowell

---

**From:** Nan <moonandstarsfarm@proton.me>  
**Sent:** Tuesday, June 27, 2023 1:42 PM  
**To:** S. Scott McDowell  
**Subject:** Minutes correction

Hi Scott-  
Can you please correct my comments in the minutes?

Steve and I have relocated swarms FROM Joni's barn, Cyndi's garden, and the Lemhouse property. (Sherri knew we collect swarms, so had called us.)

Thanks  
Nan

PS: Glad that I am not tasked with taking minutes on these meetings! Hard job.

Sent with [Proton Mail](#) secure email.